IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF TENNESSEE NASHVILLE DIVISION

EIGHT MILE STYLE, LLC; MARTIN AFFILIATED, LLC,

Plaintiffs,

v.

SPOTIFY USA INC.; THE HARRY FOX AGENCY LLC,

Defendants.

SPOTIFY USA INC.,

Third-Party Plaintiff,

v.

KOBALT MUSIC PUBLISHING AMERICA, INC.

Third-Party Defendant.

CIVIL CASE NO.: 19-CV-00736

JUDGE ALETA A. TRAUGER

JURY DEMAND

<u>DEFENDANT THE HARRY FOX AGENCY LLC'S MOTION TO EXCLUDE THE</u> <u>OPINIONS OF QUENTIN BRADLEY</u>

Pursuant to Rule 702 of the Federal Rules of Evidence and Rule 26(a)(2)(B) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Defendant The Harry Fox Agency LLC ("HFA") respectfully moves this Court to exclude the testimony of Plaintiffs' proffered expert Quentin Bradley. In support of this Motion, HFA submits a Memorandum of Law and exhibits (the "Supporting Documents"), each of which have been filed under seal.

As set forth in the Supporting Documents, there are multiple infirmities in Bradley's opinions, each warranting the exclusion of his opinions. First, as evidenced in Bradley's Reports and deposition testimony, he lacks sufficient industry knowledge and experience to opine on HFA's processes as an expert in this case. Second, Bradley's technical opinions, also concerning HFA's processes, are not adequately informed by facts and data, rendering his opinions unreliable. Third, as set forth in the sealed Supporting Documents, Bradley's methods are unreliable. Fourth and finally, Bradley's inconsistent methods led him to inconsistent results.

"[T]he court's paramount consideration remains, as explicitly stated in Federal Rule of Evidence 702, whether the proffered testimony will assist the trier of fact." Level 3 Comm., LLC v. Floyd, 764 F. Supp.2d 945 (M.D. Tenn. 2011) (Trauger, J.) (citing Fed. R. Evid. 702). Based on the foregoing, and as set forth in the Supporting Documents, Bradley's opinions will not do so here. As a result, HFA respectfully requests that the Court enter an order precluding the expert witness testimony of Bradley.

Pursuant to Local Rule 7.01, HFA's counsel conferred with Plaintiffs' counsel regarding the relief sought in this motion. Plaintiffs oppose the motion.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jay S. Bowen

Jay S. Bowen (BPR No. 2649)

Lauren Kilgore (BPR No. 30219)

Jacob T. Clabo (BPR No. 36760)

SHACKELFORD, BOWEN, MCKINLEY & NORTON, LLP

1 Music Circle South, Ste. 300

Nashville, TN 37203

Telephone: (615) 256-7200

Facsimile: (615) 329-4485

ibowen@shackelford.law

lkilgore@shackelford.law

jclabo@shackelford.law

Attorneys for The Harry Fox Agency LLC

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and accurate copy of **DEFENDANT THE HARRY FOX** AGENCY LLC'S MOTION TO EXCLUDE THE OPINIONS OF QUENTIN BRADLEY was filed electronically with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system. Notice of this filing will be sent to all parties and counsel of record by operation of the Court's CM/ECF system, and via electronic and/or U.S. mail, postage prepaid, on September 22, 2023, to:

Jay S. Bowen Lauren E. Kilgore Jacob T. Clabo SHACKELFORD BOWEN MCKINLEY & NORTON LLP 1 Music Circle South, Suite 300 Nashville, TN 37203 Telephone: (615) 329-4440 jbowen@shackelford.law lkilgore@shackelford.law *jclabo@shackelford.law* Attorneys for Harry Fox Agency, LLC

Chris M. LaRocco Matias Gallego-Manzano BRYAN CAVE LEIGHTON PAISNER, LLP 1290 A venue of the Americas New York, NY 10104 chris.larocco@bclplaw.com matias.gallego-manzano@bclplaw.com Attorneys for Harry Fox Agency, LLC

Kathleen M. Sullivan (pro hac vice) Carey R. Ramos (pro hac vice) Cory Struble (pro hac vice) Rachel E. Epstein (pro hac vice) Mario O. Gazzola (pro hac vice) QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART & SULLIVAN, LLP 51 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor New York, NY 10010 Telephone: (212) 895-2500 kathleensullivan@quinnemanuel.com careyramos@quinnemanuel.com corystruble@quinnemanuel.com rachelepstein@quinnemanuel.com mariogazzola@quinnemanuel.com Attorneys for Spotify USA Inc.

Matthew D. Ingber (pro hac vice) Rory K. Schneider (pro hac vice) Allison Aviki (pro hac vice) Alina Artunian (pro hac vice) MAYER BROWN, LLP 1221 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10020 Telephone: (212) 506-2500 mingber@mayerbrown.com rschneider@mayerbrown.com aaviki@mayerbrown.com aartunian@mayerbrown.com Attorneys for Spotify USA Inc.

Allison L. Stillman (pro hac vice) LATHAM & WATKINS, LLP 1271 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10020 alli.stillman@lw.com Attorneys for Spotify USA Inc.

Marie T. Scott FISHER & PHILLIPS, LP 424 Church Street, Suite 1700 Nashville, TN 37219 mtscott@fisherphillips.com Attorneys for Spotify USA Inc.

Aubrey B. Harwell, III

NEAL & HARWELL, PLC 1201 Demonbreun Street, Suite 1000 Nashville, TN 37203 <u>tharwell@nealharwell.com</u> Attorneys for Spotify USA Inc.

Thomas C. Rubin

QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART & SULLIVAN, LLP 600 University Street, Ste. 2800 Seattle, WA 98101 tomrubin@quinnemanuel.com
Attorneys for Spotify USA Inc.

Brian D. Caplan Robert W. Clarida Julie B. Wlodinguer

REITLER KAILAS & ROSENBLATT, LLC
885 Third A venue, 20th Floor
New York, NY 10022
bcaplan@reitlerlaw.com
rclarida@reitlerlaw.com
jwlodinguer@reitlerlaw.com

Attorneys for Kobalt Music Publishing America, Inc.

Karl M. Braun

HALL BOOTH SMITH, P.C.
424 Church Street, Suite 2950
Nashville, TN 37219
kbraun@hallboothsmith.com
Attorneys for Kobalt Music Publishing America

Attorneys for Kobalt Music Publishing America, Inc.

Archis A. Parasharami
Andrew J. Pincus
MAYER BROWN, LLP
1999 K Street, NW
Washington, DC 20006
aparasharami@mayerbrown.com
apincus@mayerbrown.com
Attorneys for Spotify USA Inc.

James F. Blumstein

VANDERBILT UNIVERSITY
131 21st Avenue South
Nashville, TN 37203

<u>James.blumstein@vanderbilt.edu</u>

Attorneys for Eight Mile Style, LLC & Martin
Affiliated, LLC

Andrew Hunt Davis
Richard S. Busch
David M. Niemierzycki
Max D. Fabricant
KING & BALLOW
315 Union Street, Suite 1100
Nashville, TN 37201
Telephone: (615) 259-3456
rbusch@kingballow.com
ddavis@kingballow.com
dniemierzycki@kingballow.com

Attorneys for Eight Mile Style, LLC & Martin Affiliated, LLC

Michael C. Tackeff

U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE 719 Church Street, Suite 3300 Nashville, TN 37203 <u>michael.tackejj@usdoj.gov</u>

Attorneys for Interested Party United States of America

/s/ Jay S. Bowen
JAY S. BOWEN